

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Wednesday, June 18, 2003 12:25 PM
To: Radhakrishnan, Krish
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report



DEP.wpd



Memo to
Avaltroni.wpd

For comment

-----Original Message-----

From: Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, June 17, 2003 4:48 PM
To: RAVALTRONI@DEP.NYC.GOV
Subject: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Mr. Avaltroni,

The second attachment below contains excerpts from our draft report which concern your department. The first attachment contains a transmittal memorandum for these excerpts. As detailed in the transmittal memorandum, please let us know if you have any questions or comments. Thank you for your assistance.

Best Regards,

Chris Dunlap

(See attached file: DEP.wpd)
Avaltroni.wpd)

(See attached file: Memo to

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 20, 2003 12:43 PM
To: Hoffer, Mark
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report



DEP.wpd



Memo to
Avaltroni.wpd

Mark,

Jay Cohen from the Law Department asked me to forward this to you. We have been conversing with Jay on this. Most likely a meeting will be scheduled sometime next week with EPA and City agencies. This meeting was my idea since the document EPA wants to put out is not flattering or accurate to say the least. Jay said that the Law Department would like you to review and comment.

Thanks,

Mike for Bob

-----Original Message-----

From: Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, June 17, 2003 4:48 PM
To: RAVALTRONI@DEP.NYC.GOV
Subject: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Mr. Avaltroni,

The second attachment below contains excerpts from our draft report which concern your department. The first attachment contains a transmittal memorandum for these excerpts. As detailed in the transmittal memorandum, please let us know if you have any questions or comments. Thank you for your assistance.

Best Regards,

Chris Dunlap

(See attached file: DEP.wpd)
Avaltroni.wpd)

(See attached file: Memo to

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 12:43 PM
To: Hoffer, Mark
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report



DEP.wpd



Memo to
Avaltroni.wpd

Jane for Bob Avaltroni

Jay Cohen from NYC Law Department (212 341-3687) called a few minutes ago requesting Bob or Mike to go to North Carolina on Tuesday for a meeting on the below issue. I paged Bob and he asked me to send the request up to you. Bob's [REDACTED] PII so he will not be in but, if necessary, he supposes Mike Gilsenan could go [REDACTED] PII [REDACTED] PII Bob asked if you would speak to the Commissioner in his absence.

-----Original Message-----

From: Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, June 17, 2003 4:48 PM
To: RAVALTRONI@DEP.NYC.GOV
Subject: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Mr. Avaltroni,

The second attachment below contains excerpts from our draft report which concern your department. The first attachment contains a transmittal memorandum for these excerpts. As detailed in the transmittal memorandum, please let us know if you have any questions or comments. Thank you for your assistance.

Best Regards,

Chris Dunlap

(See attached file: DEP.wpd)
Avaltroni.wpd)

(See attached file: Memo to

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 12:49 PM
To: Levine, Robin
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report



DEP.wpd



Memo to
Avaltroni.wpd

Jane for Bob Avaltroni

Robin,

I called up to confirm that Mark received this but he wasn't there and they weren't sure if he was in so I just wanted to forward to someone else so this doesn't fall through the cracks. Should I forward to the Commissioner directly?

-----Original Message-----

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 12:43 PM
To: Hoffer, Mark
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Jane for Bob Avaltroni

Jay Cohen from NYC Law Department (212 341-3687) called a few minutes ago requesting Bob or Mike to go to North Carolina on Tuesday for a meeting on the below issue. I paged Bob and he asked me to send the request up to you. Bob's PII so he will not be in but, if necessary, he supposes Mike Gilsenan could go PII PII. Bob asked if you would speak to the Commissioner in his absence.

-----Original Message-----

From: Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, June 17, 2003 4:48 PM
To: RAVALTRONI@DEP.NYC.GOV
Subject: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Mr. Avaltroni,

The second attachment below contains excerpts from our draft report which concern your department. The first attachment contains a transmittal memorandum for these excerpts. As detailed in the transmittal memorandum, please let us know if you have any questions or comments. Thank you for your assistance.

Best Regards,

Chris Dunlap

(See attached file: DEP.wpd)
Avaltroni.wpd)

(See attached file: Memo to

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 12:58 PM
To: Levine, Robin
Subject: FW: EPA - WTC - EPA OIG Report

Background on other e-mail re NYC Law request

-----Original Message-----

From: Hoffer, Mark
Sent: Tuesday, June 24, 2003 2:19 PM
To: Avaltroni, Robert; Gilsenan, Michael
Cc: Schiano, Frank
Subject: EPA - WTC - EPA OIG Report

As requested, I've looked at the excerpts EPA has given us from the draft report and discussed it with Frank.

Since most of my knowledge about EPA/DEP dealings is second-hand, I'm probably not the best source of information about this, but I do have some reactions to the draft:

1 - In the excerpts from Chapter 3 "Initial Actions Taken by New York City and EPA",

a - 1st par., 2nd-4th sentences - The gist of this appears to be "EPA offered to help on indoor and outdoor clean-up, but the City turned us away, and we didn't want to raise a fuss with the City so we walked away."

Obviously, someone is trying to shift criticism from EPA to us.

The existing language is not what I understood to have happened. What I understood was that EPA immediately asserted that "it was in charge" and then subsequently discovered that it needed us to get the job done. We volunteered, fairly early on, to do the outside clean-up program (which we completed successfully). EPA then basically sat on its hands on the indoor issue until the community (and Congressman Nadler) forced them to move, and then they turned to us and said "we can't do it; we need your help in getting contractors and managing their work." And we did help.

I suggest something more accurate, replacing the entire 1st par. after the first sentence: "At an early stage, EPA and DEP discussed an exterior clean-up program, aimed at roofs and certain other outdoor surfaces of downtown buildings, where potential contamination was visible. DEP developed such a program with EPA input, and successfully completed same by approximately _____. A total of _____ buildings received outdoor cleaning under this program. EPA, in turn, developed an indoor residential testing and clean-up program, and successfully completed same by approximately _____, utilizing assistance from DEP in procuring contractors. A total of _____ residential apartments were cleaned under this program. "

b - 2nd par, captioned "New York City's Initial Response to Indoor Contamination"

The 1st sentence suggests that the City was somehow "wrong" or "sloppy" in deciding that it was the responsibility of individual property owners to clean their buildings. That is absolute nonsense. Property owners are responsible for the safety of their buildings generally, had the access to perform clean-up, and had insurance proceeds (at least in many cases) to perform the clean-up themselves. Conversely, the City had and has no obligation to clean up private property.

As far as I know, EPA had no objection to putting the initial obligation where it belonged: with the property owners.

I suggest replacing the first sentence with something like: "New York City advised building owners that, consistent with their ongoing legal obligation to ensure the safety of their respective properties, the owners were responsible for cleaning their buildings in accordance with applicable laws, rules and regulations, including exteriors and interiors. As previously noted, the City extended assistance to building owners by implementing a City-managed building exterior clean-up program."

If you would like to discuss the above, Frank and I are available at your convenience. If you agree with the above and want me to pass it along to the Law Department, let me know.

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 4:10 PM
To: Levine, Robin
Subject: Re: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Jane-Pls. Send a copy hand deliver to Shauna. Pls. Tell her Hoffer has it . Also, pls. Advise Mike. Thanks.

Sent from Bob's BlackBerry Wireless Handheld

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 4:11 PM
To: Maldonado, Jane
Subject: Fw: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Sent from Bob's BlackBerry Wireless Handheld

-----Original Message-----

From: Avaltroni, Robert <ravaltroni@dep.nyc.gov>
To: Levine, Robin <rlevine@dep.nyc.gov>
Sent: Fri Jun 27 16:10:19 2003
Subject: Re: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Jane-Pls. Send a copy hand deliver to Shauna. Pls. Tell her Hoffer has it . Also, pls. Advise Mike. Thanks.

Sent from Bob's BlackBerry Wireless Handheld

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 4:21 PM
To: Grob, Shauna
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report



DEP.wpd



Memo to
Avaltroni.wpd

Jane for Bob Avaltroni

For your information if you want to touch base with Mark Hoffer on this request

-----Original Message-----

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 12:43 PM
To: Hoffer, Mark
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Jane for Bob Avaltroni

Jay Cohen from NYC Law Department (212 341-3687) called a few minutes ago requesting Bob or Mike to go to North Carolina on Tuesday for a meeting on the below issue. I paged Bob and he asked me to send the request up to you. Bob's [REDACTED] so he will not be in but, if necessary, he supposes Mike Gilsenan could go [REDACTED] PII [REDACTED] Bob asked if you would speak to the Commissioner in his absence.

-----Original Message-----

From: Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, June 17, 2003 4:48 PM
To: RAVALTRONI@DEP.NYC.GOV
Subject: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Mr. Avaltroni,

The second attachment below contains excerpts from our draft report which concern your department. The first attachment contains a transmittal memorandum for these excerpts. As detailed in the transmittal memorandum, please let us know if you have any questions or comments. Thank you for your assistance.

Best Regards,

Chris Dunlap

(See attached file: DEP.wpd)
Avaltroni.wpd)

(See attached file: Memo to

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 4:23 PM
To: Radhakrishnan, Krish
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report



DEP.wpd



Memo to
Avaltroni.wpd

Bob asked me to forward this request from J. Cohen for your info. Might need to get some things together Monday morning to prepare for telecommunications call?

-----Original Message-----

From: Avaltroni, Robert
Sent: Friday, June 27, 2003 12:43 PM
To: Hoffer, Mark
Subject: FW: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Jane for Bob Avaltroni

Jay Cohen from NYC Law Department (212 341-3687) called a few minutes ago requesting Bob or Mike to go to North Carolina on Tuesday for a meeting on the below issue. I paged Bob and he asked me to send the request up to you. Bob's [PII] so he will not be in but, if necessary, he supposes Mike Gilsenan could go [PII] [PII] Bob asked if you would speak to the Commissioner in his absence.

-----Original Message-----

From: Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Dunlap.Chris@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Tuesday, June 17, 2003 4:48 PM
To: RAVALTRONI@DEP.NYC.GOV
Subject: Excerpts From OIG Draft Report

Mr. Avaltroni,

The second attachment below contains excerpts from our draft report which concern your department. The first attachment contains a transmittal memorandum for these excerpts. As detailed in the transmittal memorandum, please let us know if you have any questions or comments. Thank you for your assistance.

Best Regards,

Chris Dunlap

(See attached file: DEP.wpd)
 Avaltroni.wpd)

(See attached file: Memo to