

Avaltroni, Robert

From: Bennett, Paul
Sent: Friday, February 08, 2002 6:49 PM
To: Chapin, Diana 001; Avaltroni, Robert; Gilsenan, Michael (ex); Greeley, Douglas; Kelpin, Gerry 001
Cc: Sturcken, Charles 001; Ryan, Geoff 001; Richardson, Charmaine 001
Subject: FW: NIOSH Summary Results

Haven't had a chance to read the attachment, but I pass it along to you FYI.

Paul.

-----Original Message-----

From: Kelly McKinney [mailto:kmckinne@health.nyc.gov]
Sent: Friday, February 08, 2002 4:42 PM
To: amirpat@aol.com; spryce@dcas.nyc.gov; adamsr@ddc.nyc.gov; RottneB@ddc.nyc.gov; paulb@dep.nyc.gov; clark-patricia-k@dol.gov; fitzpatf@fdny.nyc.gov; headlet@fdny.nyc.gov; mekris@gw.dec.state.ny.us; Allan Goldberg; Christopher D'Andrea; Jessica Leighton; Jim Miller; Jeanine Prudhomme; Kenneth Carlino; mnc01@health.state.ny.us; rjt03@health.state.ny.us; arasheed@nypd.org; pbennett@nysnet.net; LHenry@OEM.NYC.GOV; sbenson@OEM.NYC.GOV; bpclarke@yahoo.com
Cc: tjdowd@bechtel.com
Subject: NIOSH Summary Results

At the request of the Department of Health, a team of industrial hygienists from the National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) conducted a broad-based assessment of air quality on the debris pile at the site of the WTC disaster. The first samples were collected on September 18th and the results were used to confirm protective equipment requirements and to revise work procedures. A summary of those results has just become available and is attached. This document provides insight into air quality at Ground Zero in the early days of the city's response.

Kelly R McKinney PE
 Associate Commissioner
 Regulatory and Environmental Health Services
 NYC Department of Health
 125 Worth Street, Room 616, CN-32
 New York NY 10013
 212.295.5389
 212.431.2585 fax
 917.731.5593 cell



NIOSH WTC Final
 Summary.doc



THE CITY OF NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION
JOEL A. MIELE, SR., P.E. Commissioner

PHONE (718) 595-4418
FAX (718) 595-4422

ROBERT C. AVALTRONI
Deputy Commissioner

Bureau of
Air, Noise, & Hazardous
Materials

59-17 Junction Boulevard, 11th Floor, Corona, New York 11368-5107



Summary Report to the New York City Department of Health:

NIOSH Air Sample Results
for the World Trade Center Disaster Response

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health

From September 18 through October 4, 2001, National Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) personnel (and contractors) collected air samples in areas immediately adjacent to the debris pile and on personnel actively involved in rescue efforts on or in the vicinity of the debris pile to characterize occupational exposures during the disaster response at the World Trade Center site in New York City, NY. This report is a compilation of sampling efforts that were undertaken over the course of providing technical assistance to the New York City Department of Health (NYCDOH), and were used to identify potential hazards and to recommend appropriate protective measures where needed for the workers whose exposures were sampled. As a result of this activity, workers using acetylene torches to cut metal beams were found to have hazardous exposures to carbon monoxide; this information led to interventions that addressed the problem. Because these findings are based on limited sampling, they may not be representative of more general exposures. However, they are consistent with those reported by the Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) and the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). The area air samples were collected in the immediate vicinity of workers at a height approximating their breathing zone. The personal air samples were collected on workers with the sampling device placed in the worker's breathing zone. Additional bulk sampling was conducted and results were included in the daily summaries to the NYCDOH. Blank sampling was also performed for quality assurance; these results are not included in this report.

Asbestos:

A total of 827 air samples were collected for asbestos. No fibers were detected in over 50% (455) of these air samples as determined by phase contrast microscopy (PCM). The remaining 372 air samples indicated time-weighted average (TWA) concentrations ranging up to 0.89 fibers/cc as determined by PCM. Twenty-five of these samples exceeded the NIOSH recommended exposure limit (REL) and the OSHA permissible exposure limit (PEL) of 0.10 fibers/cc. In addition, 119 of these air samples were analyzed for asbestos by transmission electron microscopy (TEM), a more sensitive analytical method that can distinguish between asbestos and non-asbestos fibers. No asbestos fibers were detected in over 45% (56) of these air samples as determined by TEM. The remaining 63 air samples indicated TWA concentrations ranging up to 0.063 asbestos fibers/cc as determined by TEM, none of which exceeded the NIOSH REL and the OSHA PEL of 0.10 fibers/cc. These TEM results indicate that the vast



**Department of
Environmental
Protection**

59-17 Junction Boulevard
Corona, New York
11368-5107

**Joel A. Miele Sr., P.E.
Commissioner**



www.ci.nyc.ny.us/dep

(718) DEP-HELP

majority of the fibers reported from the PCM analyses are non-asbestos fibers. Further analyses are being performed to determine the nature of these non-asbestos fibers.

Carbon Monoxide:

A total of 98 air samples were collected for carbon monoxide indicating TWA concentrations ranging from 0.16 to 242 ppm. All but 4 of these measurements were below the NIOSH REL of 35 ppm and all but 1 were below the OSHA PEL of 50 ppm. One sample (242 ppm) exceeded the NIOSH recommended ceiling limit of 200 ppm. Additionally, 2 instantaneous peak measurements (1,239 and 1,368 ppm) exceeded the NIOSH immediately dangerous to life or health (IDLH) value of 1,200 ppm and 15 others exceeded the NIOSH recommended ceiling limit of 200 ppm. All carbon monoxide measurements exceeding one or more of these evaluation criteria were being performed by workers using either a cutting torch or a cutting saw. This underscores the need for adequate ventilation and worker awareness when using these tools.

Diesel Exhaust:

A total of 8 air samples were collected for diesel exhaust indicating TWA (elemental carbon) concentrations from none detected to 0.023 mg/m^3 . These measurements are all well below the proposed American Conference of Governmental Industrial Hygienists (ACGIH[®]) threshold limit value (TLV[®]) for diesel exhaust of 0.20 mg/m^3 (elemental carbon). (NIOSH and OSHA currently have no evaluation criteria for diesel exhaust.)

Freon[®] 22:

A total of 5 air samples were collected for Freon[®] 22 (chlorodifluoromethane). No Freon[®] 22 was detected on any of these air samples.

Hydrogen Sulfide:

A total of 10 air samples were collected for hydrogen sulfide. Hydrogen sulfide was detected on only 1 of these samples indicating a TWA concentration of 1.0 ppm and a instantaneous peak concentration of 3.0 ppm. These measurements are well below the NIOSH recommended ceiling limit and the OSHA ceiling limit of 10 ppm.

Inorganic Acids:

A total of 27 air samples were collected for inorganic acids including hydrobromic, hydrochloric, hydrofluoric, nitric, phosphoric, and sulfuric acids. Except for sulfuric acid, only trace amounts of inorganic acids were detected on these samples. Small quantities of sulfuric acid were detected on all but 1 of the air samples which were below the NIOSH REL and OSHA PEL of 1.0 mg/m^3 .



**Department of
Environmental
Protection**

59-17 Junction Boulevard
Corona, New York
11368-5107

**Joel A. Miele Sr., P.E.
Commissioner**



www.ci.nyc.ny.us/dep

(718) DEP-HELP

Mercury:

A total of 16 air samples were collected for mercury indicating TWA concentrations from none detected to 0.002 mg/m^3 . These measurements are all well below the NIOSH recommended ceiling limit and the OSHA ceiling limit of 0.1 mg/m^3 .

Metals:

A total of 45 air samples were collected for 27 different metals including arsenic, beryllium, cadmium, chromium, cobalt, lead, magnesium, manganese, molybdenum, nickel, phosphorus, selenium, silver, tellurium, thallium, vanadium, and zinc. Only trace amounts of these metals were detected on any of the air samples.

Polynuclear Aromatic Hydrocarbons:

A total of 12 air samples were collected for 16 different polynuclear aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) including anthracene, benzo(a)anthracene, benzo(b)fluoranthene, benzo(a)pyrene, chrysene, phenanthrene, and pyrene. Only trace amounts of PAHs were detected on any the air samples. Four of the PAHs detected on the air samples in trace amounts are the suspected human carcinogens benzo(a)anthracene, benzo(b)fluoranthene, benzo(a)pyrene, and chrysene.

Respirable Particulate:

A total of 18 air samples were collected for respirable particulate and indicated TWA concentrations ranging from none detected to 0.32 mg/m^3 . These measurements are well below the OSHA PEL of 5 mg/m^3 . (NIOSH does not currently have an REL for respirable particulate.)

Respirable Crystalline Silica:

A total of 18 air samples were collected for respirable crystalline silica. No respirable crystalline silica was detected on any of these air samples.

Total Particulate:

A total of 36 air samples were collected for total particulate and indicated TWA concentrations ranging from none detected to 2.3 mg/m^3 . These measurements are well below the OSHA PEL for total particulate of 15 mg/m^3 . (NIOSH does not currently have an REL for total particulate.)

Volatile Organic Hydrocarbons:

A total of 76 air samples were collected for volatile organic hydrocarbons including benzene, ethyl benzene, styrene, toluene, and xylene(s). Except for benzene, only trace amounts of VOCs were detected on any of these air samples. Two of these samples (0.35 and 0.46 mg/m^3)



**Department of
Environmental
Protection**

59-17 Junction Boulevard
Corona, New York
11368-5107

**Joel A. Miele Sr., P.E.
Commissioner**



www.ci.nyc.ny.us/dep

(718) DEP-HELP

exceeded the NIOSH REL for benzene of 0.32 mg/m^3 but did not exceed the OSHA PEL for benzene of 3.2 mg/m^3 .



**Department of
Environmental
Protection**

59-17 Junction Boulevard
Corona, New York
11368-5107

**Joel A. Miele Sr., P.E.
Commissioner**



www.ci.nyc.ny.us/dep

(718) DEP-HELP